



Cartography and Geographic Information Systems

EDITORIAL STAFF

Editor

Robert B. McMaster
Department of Geography
University of Minnesota
414 Social Sciences Building
Minneapolis, MN 55455
612/625-9883
612/625-6080

Associate Editors

Patricia P. Gilmartin
Department of Geography
University of South Carolina
Columbia, SC 29208
803/777-5235

Harold Moellering
Department of Geography
Ohio State University
103 Bricker Hall
Columbus, OH 43210-1361
614/292-2608

Technical Notes Editor

Thomas W. Hodler
Department of Geography
University of Georgia
Athens, GA 30602
404/542-2856

Book Review Editor

Laurence W. Carstensen Jr.
Department of Geography
Virginia Tech
301 Patton Hall
Blacksburg, VA 24061-0115
703/231-6886

Software Review Editor

Terry A. Slocum
Department of Geography
University of Kansas
Lawrence, KS 66045
913/864-5538

Recent Literature Editor

Jovanka Ristic
American Geographical
Society Collection
University of Wisconsin-
Milwaukee Library
P.O. Box 399
Milwaukee, WI 53201
800/558-8993

EDITORIAL BOARD

Marc P. Armstrong
Barbara P. Bottenfield
Keith C. Clarke
Andrew U. Frank
Alan M. MacEachren
David M. Mark
Jean-Claude Muller
Timothy L. Nyerges
John P. Snyder
David Woodward

ACSM

American Congress on Surveying and Mapping
5410 Grosvenor Lane □ Bethesda, MD 20814
(301) 493-0200 □ Fax (301) 493-8245

January 6th, 1993

Mr. John B. Krygier
Department of Geography
Pennsylvania State University
302 Walker Building
University Park, PA 16802

Ref: C&GIS ms 92-12

Dear Mr. Krygier:

I have now received the two reviews of your paper "Sound Variables, Sound Maps, and Cartographic Design", which you submitted for consideration as an article in Cartography and Geographic Information Systems. **I am sorry to inform you that your paper can not be accepted for publication in CaGIS.**

I have labelled the reviews 92-12-01 and 92-12-02. As you will note from Review 1, which provides a detailed analysis of the typology, the reviewer critiques this paper from a musicians viewpoint. Also note this reviewer's paragraph 3, which states, "And I think the musical typology proposed in this paper is questionable at best," Basically, this reviewer disagrees with your Bertin-style typology. Note the comment here, in the last paragraph, "So, create a typology if you must, but leave out the pairings with Bertin." But also note the last sentence that states, "But first publish the outer two parts: they are good and timely, and they shouldn't have to wait while we experiment with the ideas in the middle."

Reviewer 2, likewise, does not support publication. As this reviewer remarks in the last paragraph, "The author needs to make the case that sound can be used successfully to communicate spatially differentiated information. This can only be demonstrated with experimental results."

My interpretation of the reviews is that both reviewers thought the idea to be intriguing and potentially publishable, but not at this stage in development. I hope you take the reviews in the spirit in which they were intended. It is not always easy to do so. I would be happy to discuss the reviews with you further.

On behalf of both the editorial staff and board of Cartography and Geographic Information Systems I would like to thank you for submitting your research.

Telephone: McMaster Office: 612/625-9883
Geography Department: 612/625-6080
Email: McMaster@atlas.socsci.umn.edu
FAX: 612/624-1044



Cartography and Geographic Information Systems

EDITORIAL STAFF

Editor

Robert B. McMaster
Department of Geography
University of Minnesota
414 Social Sciences Building
Minneapolis, MN 55455
612/625-9883
612/625-6080

Associate Editors

Patricia P. Gilmartin
Department of Geography
University of South Carolina
Columbia, SC 29208
803/777-5235

Harold Moellering
Department of Geography
Ohio State University
103 Bricker Hall
Columbus, OH 43210-1361
614/292-2608

Technical Notes Editor

Thomas W. Hodler
Department of Geography
University of Georgia
Athens, GA 30602
404/542-2866

Book Review Editor

Laurence W. Carstensen Jr.
Department of Geography
Virginia Tech
301 Patton Hall
Blacksburg, VA 24061-0115
703/231-6886

Software Review Editor

Terry A. Slocum
Department of Geography
University of Kansas
Lawrence, KS 66045
313/864-5538

Recent Literature Editor

Jovanka Ristić
American Geographical
Society Collection
University of Wisconsin-
Milwaukee Library
PO Box 299
Milwaukee, WI 53201
800/558-8993

EDITORIAL BOARD

Marc P. Armstrong
Barbara P. Butterfield
Keith C. Clarke
Andrew U. Frank
Alan M. MacEachren
David M. Mark
Jean-Claude Muller
Timothy L. Nyerges
John P. Snyder
David Woodward

ACSM

American Congress on Surveying and Mapping
5410 Grosvenor Lane □ Bethesda, MD 20814
(301) 493-0200 □ Fax (301) 493-8245

January 6th, 1993

Mr. John B. Krygier
Department of Geography
Pennsylvania State University
302 Walker Building
University Park, PA 16802

Ref: C&GIS ms 92-12

Dear Mr. Krygier:

I have now received the two reviews of your paper "Sound Variables, Sound Maps, and Cartographic Design", which you submitted for consideration as an article in Cartography and Geographic Information Systems. I am sorry to inform you that your paper can not be accepted for publication in CaGIS.

I have labelled the reviews 92-12-01 and 92-12-02. As you will note from Review 1, which provides a detailed analysis of the typology, the reviewer critiques this paper from a musicians viewpoint. Also note this reviewer's paragraph 3, which states, "And I think the musical typology proposed in this paper is questionable at best," Basically, this reviewer disagrees with your Bertin-style typology. Note the comment here, in the last paragraph, "So, create a typology if you must, but leave out the pairings with Bertin." But also note the last sentence that states, "But first publish the outer two parts: they are good and timely, and they shouldn't have to wait while we experiment with the ideas in the middle."

Reviewer 2, likewise, does not support publication. As this reviewer remarks in the last paragraph, "The author needs to make the case that sound can be used successfully to communicate spatially differentiated information. This can only be demonstrated with experimental results."

My interpretation of the reviews is that both reviewers thought the idea to be intriguing and potentially publishable, but not at this stage in development. I hope you take the reviews in the spirit in which they were intended. It is not always easy to do so. I would be happy to discuss the reviews with you further.

On behalf of both the editorial staff and board of Cartography and Geographic Information Systems I would like to thank you for submitting your research.

Telephone: McMaster Office: 612/625-9883
Geography Department: 612/625-6080
Email: McMaster@atlas.socsci.umn.edu
FAX: 612/624-1044